

May 17, 2004

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Graney, Mrs. Picton

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Smith, Mr. Talbot, Mr. Treadway

ALTERNATES PRESENT: Mrs. Boyer, Mr. Chute, Mrs. Rives

STAFF PRESENT: Mrs. Shade

OTHERS PRESENT: Mrs. Beck, Mr. Godwin, Mr. Pleasants, Mr. Woodward

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Beck(continued) /129 Calhoun Street /Addition to existing house.

Mr. Graney reconvened the Public Hearing at 7:36PM to consider the application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted 4/5/04 by Julian and Pamela Beck, 129 Calhoun Street, to construct an addition to existing house. He seated the members and seated Alternate Boyer for Mr. Talbot, Alternate Chute for Mr. Treadway and Alternate Rives for Mr. Smith. Mrs. Beck was present.

The members studied the new drawings submitted 5/14/04 and discussed the changes with Mrs. Beck. She explained the addition is now two-story instead of one and is pushed back by about 15ft. They studied the floor plan along with the previously submitted photos. They concluded approximately 660sqft would be added to the existing house. Mrs. Picton said she appreciated Mrs. Beck's attempts to modify the plans to comply with comments from the members.

The Commission discussed the windows in the addition. Mrs. Picton suggested moving the two upper windows closer together so they would be centered above the windows below. Mrs. Beck said she needs the windows as shown for light in the bedroom and bathroom. If the windows were to be moved, they would not make sense inside. Mr. Chute said he had a problem with the side of the upper windows being so close to the edge of the house. He asked if they would be visible from the road. Mrs. Beck said they would not be very visible from Calhoun Street. Mrs. Boyer asked where the bathroom vent would be located. Mrs. Beck did not know.

Mr. Graney asked the members if they had any other questions. Mrs. Picton observed that the eave detailing, frieze boards and corner boards were not shown on the plans and asked if they would match those on the existing house. Mrs. Beck replied they would. Mr. Graney asked if they were planning on adding shutters. Yes. Mr. Chute returned to the discussion on the two upper windows. He said it would be better if the size of those windows could be adjusted - but he realizes the problem is, they are reusing these windows instead of buying new ones.

Mr. Graney noted the details for the addition were very similar to the existing house and asked if there were some way to differentiate the addition from the old main house. Mrs. Beck said she thought setting the addition back made it appear different.

Mr. Graney asked the members if they needed any more clarification on details. Mrs. Boyer wanted to know if the foundation on the addition would be concrete or faced with stone. Mrs. Beck will check, but they will probably continue with whatever is existing. Mr. Graney asked if there would be any difference in the floor levels between the existing house and the addition. No. He asked if the addition will have a crawlspace or full basement. Probably a crawlspace. Mrs. Boyer asked what type materials are to be used on the roof. Mrs. Beck said the roof will match the shingles on the existing house. Mr. Graney noted the roof appears to be a flat roof from the road and shingles may not be appropriate for a flat roof. Mrs. Beck said she would check on the exact materials being used. Mr. Graney asked if they are planning any

exterior lighting. No.

Mr. Graney asked the members if they had any additional questions or comments. There were none.

MOTION: To close the Public Hearing to consider the application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Julian and Pamela Beck, 129 Calhoun Street, to construct an addition on existing house. By Mrs. Rives, seconded by Mrs. Boyer and passed 5-0.

Mr. Graney closed the Public Hearing at 8:07PM.

This Public Hearing was recorded on tape. The tape is on file in the Land Use Office, Bryan Memorial Town Hall, Washington Depot, Connecticut.

Calhoun Street LLC /175 Calhoun Street /Connector between garage and house.

Mr. Graney opened the Public Hearing at 8:10PM to consider the application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted 5/3/04 by Calhoun Street LLC, 175 Calhoun Street, to build a connector between the garage and house. He read the legal notice which appeared in **Voices** on 5/9/04. Mr. Graney seated the members and seated Alternate Boyer for Mr. Talbot, Alternate Chute for Mr. Treadway and Alternate Rives for Mr. Smith. Mr. Godwin and Mr. Pleasants were present along with their builder, Mr. Woodward.

Mr. Godwin and Mr. Pleasants presented drawings requested by the Commission (rec'd 5/17/04) showing different configurations for the connector: 1)open breezeway with just a roof, 2)heavily glazed with a french door, and 3)siding with two windows and french door. The Commission discussed the drawings. Mr. Chute said the addition of the connector makes the house become a big mass.

If possible, Mr. Godwin said they would like to side the garage and connector with wood shingles and let them weather. The house will be white clapboard. Since a change in siding was not listed in the legal notice, this issue will need to be decided in a future meeting.

Mr. Godwin pointed out the new garage doors with two rows of lights at the top. The members briefly discussed the new doors. Mr. Pleasants said they could eliminate the new garage doors if the Commission preferred. Mrs. Picton thinks they are an improvement. The windows on the garage doors seem appropriate, they work with the entire door unit. Mr. Chute asked if it was necessary to have a door in the connector. Mr. Pleasants said they could change the connector to have just the two windows, or one single door instead of the french door. Mrs. Boyer commented that all connected, it gets so massive. Mr. Godwin said the connector is low and very little will be visible from the road.

Mr. Graney asked the Commission if they were ready to vote. All agreed they were.

MOTION: To close the Public Hearing to consider the application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Calhoun Street, LLC, 175 Calhoun Street, to construct a connector between garage and house. By Mrs. Rives, seconded by Mrs. Boyer and passed 5-0.

Mr. Graney closed the Public Hearing at 8:45PM.

This Public Hearing was recorded on tape. The tape is on file in the land Use Office, Bryan Memorial Town Hall, Washington Depot, Connecticut.

REGULAR MEETING

Mr. Graney called the meeting to order at 8:47PM and seated the members and Alternate Boyer for Mr. Talbot, Alternate Chute for Mr. Treadway and Alternate Rives for Mr. Smith.

Pending Business

Beck(continued) /129 Calhoun Street /Addition to existing house.

Mr. Graney noted that a 660sqft addition is being proposed for an existing 4,319sqft house which has been added on to throughout history. He wondered about the purpose of the addition. In his opinion, this addition detracts from the existing historic addition (built sometime in the 19th century). Mrs. Picton said the Commission can't judge on the basis of their program. Mr. Graney said program or not, he thinks it detracts.

Mrs. Picton said she has reservations about the windows on the second floor on the north side. They will be visible coming down Calhoun Street. Mr. Chute said he also has reservations about the windows. Mrs. Boyer said she thinks the change they made is wonderful.

Mr. Graney said there are too many holes in the application; detail of the windows, roof and foundation. Mrs. Rives said her objection is based on more than incompleteness. Mr. Chute said if the members object to volume, Mr. and Mrs. Beck should be told rather than say the application is incomplete. He added, whatever they do should not destroy the historic nature of the house. Mrs. Picton said she always felt the 19th century addition was awkward - she does not agree with Mr. Graney. Mrs. Boyer commented one would just catch a fleeting glance of the addition from the road. Mr. Graney said it would be an important visual - you would see an almost flat roofed addition. Mrs. Picton noted because the addition will be set back, it won't look as high. Mr. Chute said old houses have been added onto with near flat roofs. Mr. Graney said he is worried about the effect on the historic integrity of the house.

Mrs. Picton said if the application is denied, the Commission needs to communicate its concerns to the Becks and what they need to do. Mr. Graney said they could deny without prejudice in terms of the details they need in order to vote. Mrs. Picton said she does not think what will be seen from the road will be jarring or incongruent. Mr. Chute said the addition is not of concern to him - filling in the hole and adding on to the unfortunate addition does not bother him. Mrs. Boyer said she does not have a problem either. The members discussed the windows on the addition. Mrs. Boyer said the Commission should not have to work out the details for them. Other details that need to be clarified are roofing materials, foundation veneer, and eave details.

MOTION: To deny without prejudice the application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted April 5, 2004, by Julian and Pamela Beck, 129 Calhoun Street, to construct an addition onto their existing house according to plans submitted May 15, 2004. The following details are necessary in order for the Commission to vote on the application: A. Second floor north elevation, 6 over 6 double hung windows (single or double) to match the 19th Century flat roof addition windows, B. Details on eaves, frieze & fascia boards, corner boards and watertable to match 19th Century flat roof addition, C. Roof materials to match existing, and D. Clarify if crawlspace or full basement with any ventilating windows, and foundation facing. By Mrs. Rives, seconded by Mr. Chute and passed 4-1.

Mr. Graney voted against. His reasons for doing so are stated in the minutes.

Calhoun Street LLC /175 Calhoun Street /Connector between garage and house.

Mr. Chute said he proposes the Commission approve the connector with a solid single door instead of french doors and the siding should match the garage.

Mrs. Picton said she would not approve the connector because of size. It would make the whole place read as more of a complex. The roof is high, can be seen from the road and even an open connector with roof would be objectionable.

Mr. Graney, playing devil's advocate, asked if most agricultural properties would have some type of door yard with house connected to barn. Mrs. Picton said this has nothing to do with a farm house. The connector will add to the sense of mass and complexity like what they have done to the carriage house.

Mrs. Rives said the mass of the house has already been added upon. The connector is not going to make it that much bigger. It does not bother her. Since the house predates the Historic District, she does not object to the connector.

Mrs. Boyer said she does not like the solid connector. She likes the open one. It allows you to see through. She said she agrees that the solid connector makes it a long huge mass of house and does not separate the house from the carriage house. Mr. Chute said he thinks the open connector is the most artificial and the most suburban. He does not think it is a good compromise.

Mr. Graney said looking at all the connector drawings, he prefers no connector with just a hood over the doorway to the apartment. Of the connectors, he leans toward the one which gets rid of the french doors; just having one door and one window. He said he understands the members concerns regarding mass. The question is whether or not the connector would detract from important aspects of the district. Mrs. Rives said it has already started. Mrs. Boyer agreed. The house could never have been build if it had not predated the district. Mr. Chute said what Mr. Godwin and Mr. Pleasants have done is a great improvement. Mrs. Boyer agreed. Mr. Graney said he does not know that the district is on a downward slide - the Commission has to look at what is there and whether changes enhance the district. Mrs. Picton and Mrs. Rives agreed the improvements made here have enhanced the district.

MOTION: To approve the application for Certificate of Appropriateness submitted May 3, 2004, by Calhoun Street LLC, 175 Calhoun Street, to construct an enclosed connector between the main house and garage according to plans submitted May 17, 2004 with the following stipulations: asymmetrical fenestration with a panel door and or double hung window (details matching garage windows) and siding to match carriage house/garage. This work is to be completed by May 17, 2005; else this approval shall be void. By Mrs. Rives, seconded by Mr. Chute and passed 4-1.

Mrs. Picton voted against. Her reasons for doing so are stated in the minutes.

Consideration of the Minutes

MOTION: To approve the 4/19/04 minutes as corrected:

Pg.4, Par.3, Line 5;would **be** elegant.....

And to approve the 5/04/04 minutes as corrected:

Pg.4, Par.2, Line 1;Mr. **Talbot** suggested.....

Pg.4, Par.2, Line 3;**Mr. Graney** said if Building.....

Pg.4, Par.5, Line 3;each **variance** is always.....

By Mrs. Rives, seconded by Mrs. Boyer and passed 5-0.

Correspondence

A letter was received from Daniel Martin who is doing some repair work for Debra Eldridge, 4 Parsonage Lane. He is replacing siding and replacing some storm windows. All work will be done "in kind" and does not require an application for C of A.

Mr. Chute said the Congregational Church will be replacing some siding and adding insulation. He will see that a letter is written to HDC regarding the work.

MOTION: To adjourn the meeting. By Mrs. Rives.

Mr. Graney adjourned the meeting at 11:00PM.

FILED SUBJECT TO APPROVAL

Respectfully Submitted,
Martha T. Shade, Secretary